## OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY

# (Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005) The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)

#### Appeal No.00056/2025

IN THE MATTER OF:

Mr. Dinesh Vats 202 Nidhi Plaza-1 LSC Gulabi Bagh North Delhi Delhi – 110052 Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi – 110003

Respondent

Date of Order: 18th September 2025

#### **ORDER**

- (1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal- No. ICSOI/A/E/25/00056 on 25.08.2025 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with Response vide letter dated 01.08.2025 against the Central Public Information Officer (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
- (2) The Appellant vide his RTI Application No. ICSOI/R/T/25/00027 dated 07/07/2025 has requested the following information:

"Kindly provide the following information along with duly authenticated and certified documents in support of each and every information requested to be provided to the undersigned information seeker:

- 1. The information for the total number and name of the various committee(s) including standing committees, non-standing committees, boards formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its Central Council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format as maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 2. The information for the date of creation of various committee(s), boards as mentioned in point number 1, since 2010 to 2025 by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its Central Council level, in the manner and format as maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 3. The information for the name(s) of the chairman and members of various committee(s), boards formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its Central

- Council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 4. The information for the merit(s) of the candidates, result(s) of the interview held if any, achievement and experience of the individuals appointed as chairman and/or members of the various committee(s), boards formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India at its Central Council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 5. The information and details for the agenda of the meetings, date of the meetings, minutes of the meetings, details of voting to pass the resolution for various committee(s, boards formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India at its Central Council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 6. The information and copy of the advertisement(s) including the email sent to all members and deliver proofs with time line and process to apply for the position of chairman and/or member(s) of various committees formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its Central Council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 7. The information for the name, number, date and mode of applications received from the members for the position of Chairman and member(s) of the various committees formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its central council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 8. The information for the name, number, date and mode of application rejected and accepted for the position of Chairman and member(s) of various committees formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its Central Council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 9. The information for the budget and funds allotted to various committees, boards formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its Central Council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 10. The information for the expenditures with bifurcation under different heads made by the various committees, board, etc. formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its Central Council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format as maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 11. The information for the roles, responsibilities and work profile of the various committees, boards formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its Central Council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 12. The information for the work done and achievements by the chairman and member(s) of the various committees, boards, etc. formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its Central Council level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 13. The information for the relation, association, business connection, and/ or any kind of connection including partnership, employment, training and/or any kind of personal and/or professional connection between the chairman, members appointed for various committees, board, etc. formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) and Central Council members and/or key employees of the Institute of the Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 14. The information and type of relationship between:

- CS Dhananjay Shukla (the President, ICSI), CS Yogesh Kumar (Chairman Gurugram Chapter of ICSI and member Professional Skills Enhancement Board), CS Ram Sahay (Member Gurugram Chapter of ICSI and member Peer Review Board), CS Apoorva Kumar (Member Gurugram Chapter of ICSI and member Editorial Advisory Board) and CS Devender Suhag (past Chairman NIRC of ICSI and member MSME and Start-Up Board).
- CS Manish Gupta (past President, ICSI), CS Ranjeet Pandey (past President, ICSI and Chairman ESG and Sustainability Board), CS Devendra V Deshpande (past President, ICSI and Chairman Professional Skills Enhancement Board), CS Ashish Garg (past President, ICSI and Co-Chairman ESG and Sustainability Board), CS Nagendra D Rao (past President, ICSI and Chairman Secretarial Standards Board).
- CS Manish Gupta (past President, ICSI), CS Ranjeet Pandey (past President, ICSI and Chairman MSME and Start-Up Board), CS Nesar Ahmed (past President, ICSI and member Peer Review Board), CS Rajiv Bajaj (past Central Council member, ICSI and Chairman MSME and Start-Up Board) and CS Vineet K Chaudhary (past Central Council member, ICSI and Chairman Auditing Standards Board).
- CS Manish Gupta (past President, ICSI) and CS Sachin Khurana (working with RMG & Associates and member MSME and Start-Up Board).
- CS Manish Gupta (past President, ICSI) and CS Abhinav Agarwal (member ESG and Sustainability Board).
- CS Ranjeet Pandey (past President ICSI), CS Amit Kaushal (member Auditing Standards Board) and CS Awanish Dwivedi (member Secretarial Standards Board).
- 15. The information, details and list of the candidates amongst the chairman and member(s) of various committees, boards, etc. formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI), who contested the election(s) including Central council elections, regional council elections and/or chapter elections of the ICSI at any time since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 16. The information, details and list of the candidates, used ICSI's resources and references, including misuse of power and position, etc., by the chairman and/or member(s) of various committees, boards, etc. formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) to contest the elections of ICSI at any level since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 17. The information for any kind of action including, penalty, disciplinary action, etc. by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) against the members contested the elections of ICSI by using the platform and resources of ICSI in either way as faculty, speaker and/or chairman, member of various committees, boards, etc. only to attain their election motives since 2010 to 2022, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 18. The information for the indemnity and/ or undertaking taken from the faculties, speakers of various programs organized at various and each levels of ICSI and/or

- chairman, members of various committees, boards, etc. formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) to not to contest the election by using ICSI platform and/or resources to contest the election of ICSI since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 19. The information for the name and details of members who have been found guilty of professional misconduct and/or economical or moral turpitude and appointed as faculty, speakers, etc. at various and each levels of ICSI and/or chairman and members of the various committees, boards, etc. formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India since 2010 to 2025, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 20. The information for the maximum number(s) and minimum number(s) of members can be appointed in various standing committees, non-standing committees, boards, etc. formed by the institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) in the manner and format maintained by ICSI.
- 21. The information and details of the rules/regulations/notifications, etc. formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) as per and after the order of the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi, dated 21.03.2023, issued by Hon'ble Justice Pratibha M Singh, in the manner a d format maintained by ICSI.
- 22. The information and details of the declaration for conflict of interest containing the details of partner(s), associate(s), employee(s), ex-employee(s), ex-partner(s), trainee(s), or connected in any manner with any of the employee(s), office bearer(s) and/or elected member of ICSI at any level and /or other interested party(ies) in any manner, taken from the chairman and /or member in various standing committees, non-standing committees, boards etc., formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI), in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 23. Please provide the certified copies of the all the information requested above in point number 1 to 22 above, in the manner and format maintained by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI). Also provide a suitable date and time to carry out the inspection of the documents for the information requested in point number 1 to 22 above."
- (3) The Appellant has submitted in his instant appeal regarding the reply provided by the Respondent to the RTI queries as under:

"Please accept the submission of First Appeal under the Right to Information Act, 2005."

(4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

"Written submission to query numbers 1 and 3: - "The details are available in the website of the Institute i.e. www.icsi.edu and provided in RTI Reply dated 01.08.2025."

Written submission to query numbers 2, 10, 11, 12, 15, 16 and 19: - "Our reply remains the same as the requisite information is not maintained."

**Written submission to query numbers 4, 13, 18, 21 and 22: -** "Our reply remains the same as the queries are not clear and specific."

**Written submission to query numbers 5: -** "The information sought is exempted under section 8(1)(d) and 8(1)(e) of the Right to Information Act, 2005."

**Written submission to query numbers 6, 7, and 8: -** "Our reply remains the same as no such information is available."

**Written submission to query numbers 9 and 14: -** "This is not an information, therefore, exempted U/S 2(f) of the Right to Information Act, 2005."

**Written submission to query number 17: -** "The information sought by the information seeker is not maintained. Orders w.r.t disposed of Disciplinary cases are available on the website <a href="www.icsi.edu">www.icsi.edu</a> under the link <a href="https://discipline.icsi.edu/DP Transactions/DP Order">https://discipline.icsi.edu/DP Transactions/DP Order</a>. The information seeker may refer the aforesaid link."

**Written submission to query number 20:** - "Kindly refer "The Company Secretaries Act, 1980 and The Company Secretaries Regulations, 1982" which are available in the website of the Institute, <a href="www.icsi.edu.">www.icsi.edu.</a>"

**Written submission to query number 23: -** "Not applicable in view of above-mentioned replies."

Further, it is to inform that the "the public authority under the RTI Act, 2005 is not to create or collate information; or to interpret information. Therefore, the information which is readily available in the format/content can only be provided to the appellant and not as per the choice of the information seeker. The reply(ies) to the query(ies) cannot be created and designed in the manner and wish of the appellant.

Therefore, the contents made in the RTI reply stands as it is and the appeal deserves to be dismissed."

(5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

This office concurs with the submissions of the Respondent in his reply to the instant appeal.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-

(Asit Kumar Rath)
First Appellate Authority

### Copy to:

- Mr. Dinesh Vats
   202 Nidhi Plaza-1
   LSC Gulabi Bagh
   North Delhi
   Delhi 110052
- 2. Central Public Information Officer

The Institute of Company Secretaries of India 'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road, New Delhi - 110003

3. Directorate of IT - For publishing on the website