

OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY
(Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005)
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House
C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area
Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)

Appeal No.00054/2025

IN THE MATTER OF:

Mr. Dinesh Vats
202 Nidhi Plaza-1
LSC Gulabi Bagh
North Delhi
Delhi – 110052

Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi – 110003

Respondent

Date of Order: 18th September 2025

ORDER

- (1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal- No. ICSOI/A/E/25/00054 on 24.08.2025 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with Response vide letter dated 12.08.2025 against the Central Public Information Officer (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
- (2) The Appellant vide his RTI Application No. ICSOI/R/T/25/00029 dated 16/07/2025 has requested the following information:

“Kindly provide the following information along with duly authenticated and certified documents in support of each and every information requested to be provided to the undersigned information seeker:

1. The information for the eligibility criteria to become the part time members in the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA) in July, 2025.
2. The information for the requirement of taking affidavit for non-commitment of any act of economic and/or moral turpitude, character certificate, police verification and affidavit for not connected in any manner with the present council member and office bearer of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI), from the part time member of the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA) in July, 2025.
3. The information for the procedure and mechanism including the written examination, interview, recommendation from the Central Council members and/ or office bearer

of ICSI, other reference and achievements and any monetary interest and/or professional association, if any, for the appointment of part time members in the Appellate Authority of Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA) in July, 2025.

4. The information for the advertisement of vacancy (including newspaper advertisement, website advertisement, email sent to the eligible members) for the part time members in the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI), nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA) in July, 2025.
5. The information for the name and number of eligible members to whom the advertisement for vacancy of part time members in the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) was sent in 2025.
6. The information for the total number and names of the members applied for the position of part time members in the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA) in 2025.
7. The information for the score, merit list, and result of the candidates applied for the position of part time members in the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA) in 2025.
8. The information for the name and qualification of the members of selection committee/ panel, selected the part time members of the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA) in 2025.
9. The information for the score, merit, achievements and other criteria satisfied by CS Ashish Garg and CS Rajiv Bajaj, who have been appointed as part time members of the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) vide the Gazette of India Notification dated 08.07.2025 G.S.R. 456(E) by Mr. Inder Deep Singh Dhariwal Jt. Secy., Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA).
10. The information for the eligibility of a professional partner in a commercial firm with the sitting Council member of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) and co-chairman of a committee of ICSI, to become the part time member of the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA) in 2025.
11. The information for the eligibility of a sitting committee chairman of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) to become the part time member of the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA) in 2025.
12. The information for the eligibility of a person held guilty of professional misconduct once, to become the part time member of the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA) in 2025.
13. The information for the reason of appointment of commercially connected person with the sitting council member and a sitting committee member of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) as per the Gazette of India notification dated 08.07.2025 as part time members of the Appellate Authority of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) nominated/appointed by the Ministry of Corporate Affairs (MCA), despite various senior and renowned past council members of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
14. Please provide the certified copies of the all the information requested above in point number 1 to 13 above.

15. Please provide a suitable date and time to carry out the inspection of the documents for the information requested in point number 1 to 13 above“

- (3) The Appellant has submitted in his instant appeal regarding the reply provided by the Respondent to the RTI queries as under:

“Please accept the submission of First Appeal under the Right to Information Act, 2005.”

- (4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

““Our reply remains the same as provided in RTI Reply dated 12.08.2025.”

Further, it is to inform that the “the public authority under the RTI Act, 2005 is not to create or collate information; or to interpret information. Therefore, the information which is readily available in the format/content can only be provided to the appellant and not as per the choice of the information seeker. The reply(ies) to the query(ies) cannot be created and designed in the manner and wish of the appellant.

Therefore, the contents made in the RTI reply stands as it is and the appeal deserves to be dismissed.”

- (5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

This office concurs with the submissions of the Respondent in his reply to the instant appeal.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-

(Asit Kumar Rath)
First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

1. Mr. Dinesh Vats
202 Nidhi Plaza-1
LSC Gulabi Bagh
North Delhi
Delhi – 110052
2. Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi - 110003
3. Directorate of IT - For publishing on the website