

OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY
(Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005)
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House
C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area
Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)

Appeal No.00034/2025

IN THE MATTER OF:

Mr. Dinesh Vats
202 Nidhi Plaza-1
LSC Gulabi Bagh
Delhi – 110052
North Delhi
Pin - 110052

Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi – 110003

Respondent

Date of Order: 11th June 2025

ORDER

- (1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal- No. ICSOI/A/E/25/00034 on 14.05.2025 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with Response vide letter dated 13.05.2025 against the Central Public Information Officer (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
- (2) The Appellant vide his RTI Application No. ICSOI/R/E/25/01974 dated 14/04/2025 has requested the following information:

“Kindly provide the following information along with duly authenticated and certified documents in support of each and every information requested to be provided to the information seeker:

1. Please provide the information for the each individuals served as the Secretary at the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) since its incorporation.
 - (a) Full Name of the Secretary, ICSI
 - (b) Tenure Period including date of joining and date of leaving
 - (c) Contractual or Permanent status during their tenure
 - (d) Nature of Contract including temporary or fixed term or renewable contract or permanent, etc.
 - (e) Duration of the Contract including start date and end date for contractual appointments
 - (f) Any renewals or extensions of their contract during their tenure, along with

the dates and reasons for renewals

- (g) Terms of employment including terms of employment, salary, and/or other performance based conditions
- 2. Please provide the official documents, advertisements, resolutions, and minutes of the meetings that show the original intent behind the post of Secretary being contractual at the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 3. Please provide the official documentation, resolutions and minutes of the meetings regarding the decision to transition from contractual to a permanent position of the Secretary at the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 4. Please provide the reasons, deliberations, and decision-making process Including official documents, committee reports, board resolutions and minutes of meetings regarding the decision that led to the change of the post of Secretary at the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 5. Please provide the information for the internal review process, consultation with external experts, or any assessment to convert the contractual position of Secretary into the permanent position at the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 6. Please provide the information for the governing body, Council members, and/ or committee members approved/ or against the conversion of contractual position of Secretary into the permanent position at the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI)
 - (a) Name of the President approved or against the conversion for permanent position of Secretary at ICSI
 - (b) Name of the Council member approved or against the conversion for permanent position of Secretary at ICSI
 - (c) Name of Government Nominee(s) in the council approved or against the conversion for permanent position of Secretary at ICSI
 - (d) Name of Secretary approved or against the conversion of permanent position of Secretary at ICSI
 - (e) Date of the meeting held for the conversion for permanent position of Secretary at ICSI
 - (f) Copy of official documents, agenda, resolutions, minutes of meetings and gazette notification for the conversion of contractual position of Secretary into permanent position at ICSI
- 7. Please provide the information for the appointment of Secretary on the permanent position at the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
 - (a) Name of the First Secretary appointed on the permanent position at ICSI
 - (b) Date of appointment of the first Secretary appointed on the permanent position at ICSI
 - (c) Date of joining of the first Secretary appointed on the permanent position at ICSI
 - (d) Salary including breakdown of the compensation structure, including any allowances, bonuses, or other benefits of the first Secretary appointed on the permanent position at ICSI
 - (e) Terms of appointment of the first Secretary appointed on permanent position at ICSI
 - (f) Copy of the official documents, terms of appointment, appointment letter, issued by ICSI to the first Secretary appointed on the permanent position at ICSI
- 8. Please provide the information and detailed recruitment process followed to fill the position of Secretary on permanent position at the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI), including

- (a) Advertisement released
 - (b) Application deadline
 - (c) Shortlisting and interview process
 - (d) Selection committee members
 - (e) Name and position of the interview panel members
 - (f) Qualification or expertise relevant to the selection process
 - (g) Number of applications received by ICSI for the permanent position of Secretary at ICSI
 - (h) Number of applications accepted and approved by ICSI
 - (i) Score distribution including written test, interview and/ or combined score
 - (j) Name of shortlisted candidates and their individual scores
 - (k) Criteria for shortlisting of candidates
 - (l) Minimum score or specific qualification necessary
 - (m) Criteria or factors that led to the selection of candidates for interview
9. Please provide the detailed scoring system or rubric used to assess candidates during the interview process.
 10. Please provide the information for the objections/ discrepancies raised and communicated by the Government nominee in the council of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) for the permanent position of Secretary.
 11. Please provide the information for the efforts and other tactics adopted by the then President, Council members, Secretary of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) to convince the Ministry and Government nominees for the permanent position of Secretary.
 12. Please provide the place and venue of the written test, interview for the permanent position of Secretary at ICSI.
 13. Please provide the detailed information of the candidate selected for the permanent position of Secretary at ICSI including
 - (a) Name of the final selected candidate
 - (b) Score of the selected candidate
 - (c) Qualification and experience of the selected candidate
 - (d) Score given by every member in the selection panel
 14. Please provide the resolutions and minutes of the relevant meetings confirming the final appointment of Secretary on the permanent position at ICSI.
 15. Please provide the information for the involvement of any recruitment specialized agency including UPSC, or any other board and/ or any external body in the recruitment of Secretary on the permanent position at ICSI.
 16. Please provide the information for the necessary approvals, special approvals, considerations, if any taken by ICSI for the position Secretary on permanent position at the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
 17. Please provide the information for the measures taken by Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) in the recruitment process for the Secretary on permanent position to ensure the transparency, free from bias, and followed in accordance with ICSI's policies.
 18. Please provide the information for any disqualifications, complaints, or disputes raised by any applicants and/ or member or other person during or after the recruitment process including the allegations of non-transparency, or interest involved of any council member or any other. If yes, please provide the copy of complaints, investigations and/ or action taken.
 19. Please provide the certified copy of all the information requested above in point no 1 to 18 above.
 20. Provide a suitable date and time to inspect the records related to the information

requested in all the points above.”

- (3) The Appellant has submitted in his instant appeal regarding the reply provided by the Respondent to the RTI queries as under:

“Sir, I am aggrieved by the incomplete reply provided by PIO in reply to the RTI NO. ICSOI/R/E/25/01974. In view of above, I request you to kindly accept my submission of First Appeal before you under Subsection (1) of Section 19 of the RTI Act, 2005.”

- (4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

“The written submission of the Respondent is as under:-

Written submission to query numbers 1, 19 and 20: - Our reply remains the same. “This information sought is voluminous and not available in compiled form. As per Section 7(9), since such compilation is not maintained in the form in which it is sought by the applicant and such compilation would disproportionately divert the resources. Therefore, the same cannot be provided.”.

Written submission to query numbers 2 and 11: - “This does not fall within the preview of “information” under Section 2(f).”

Written submission to query numbers 3, 4 and 5: - “This information is exempted under Sections 8(1)(d) and 8(1)(e) as it relates to internal deliberations, fiduciary matters and does not satisfy larger public interest.”

Written submission to query number 6 and 7: - “As per Section 7(9), since such compilation is not maintained in the form in which it is sought by the applicant and such compilation would disproportionately divert the resources of the public authority. Therefore, the same cannot be provided.

Further, this information is exempted under Sections 8(1)(d), 8(1)(e) and 8(1)(j) as it relates to internal deliberations, fiduciary matters and does not satisfy larger public interest.”

Written submission to query numbers 8 and 13: - “This information is exempted under Sections 8(1)(e) and 8(1)(j) as it relates to personal information of third parties, and disclosure of which has no relationship to any public activity or interest and also caused unwarranted invasion of the privacy of the individual.”

Written submission to query number 9: - “This information is exempted under Section 8(1)(e) as there is no public interest warrants the disclosure of such information.”

Written submission to query numbers 10, 12, 15 and 18: - “Query not specific.”

Written submission to query number 14: - “This information is exempted under Sections 8(1)(d) and 8(1)(e).”

Written submission to query numbers 16 and 17: - “Procedures as prescribed in the ICSI Services Rules was followed.”

Further, it is to inform that the “the public authority under the RTI Act, 2005 is not to create or collate information; or to interpret information. Therefore, the information which is readily available in the format/content can only be provided to the appellant and not as per the choice of the information seeker. The reply(ies) to the query(ies) cannot be created and designed in the manner and wish of the appellant.

Therefore, the contents made in the RTI reply stands as it is and the appeal deserves to be dismissed.”

- (5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

This office concurs with the submissions of the Respondent in his reply to the instant appeal.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-

(Asit Kumar Rath)
First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

1. Mr. Dinesh Vats
202 Nidhi Plaza-1
LSC Gulabi Bagh
Delhi – 110052
North Delhi
Pin - 110052
2. Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi - 110003
3. Directorate of IT - For publishing on the website