

OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY
(Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005)
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House
C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area
Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)

Appeal No.00033/2025

IN THE MATTER OF:

Mr. Dinesh Vats
202 Nidhi Plaza-1
LSC Gulabi Bagh
Delhi – 110052
North Delhi
Pin - 110052

Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi – 110003

Respondent

Date of Order: 11th June 2025

ORDER

- (1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal- No. ICSOI/A/E/25/00033 on 14.05.2025 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with Response vide letter dated 13.05.2025 against the Central Public Information Officer (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
- (2) The Appellant vide his RTI Application No. ICSOI/R/E/25/01975 dated 14/04/2025 has requested the following information:

“Kindly provide the following information along with duly authenticated and certified documents in support of each and every information requested to be provided to the information seeker:

1. Please provide information for year wise and month wise data for the past Ten (10) years on the total number of students enrolled in each course of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI), namely:
 - (a) CSEET / Foundation
 - (b) Executive
 - (c) Professional
2. Please provide the information for the number of students appearing for the June and December, examinations in each courses of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) in the past Ten (10) years including, namely:
 - (a) CSEET / Foundation

- (b) Executive
- (c) Professional
- 3. Please provide the percentage of enrolled students appeared for examinations of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) in the past Ten (10) years, in each category:
 - (a) CSEET / Foundation
 - (b) Executive
 - (c) Professional
- 4. Please provide the detailed information with reasons identified by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) or any report/ documents/ internal studies for lesser admissions and very few students appearing for the examinations of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) in the past 10 years.
- 5. Please provide the details including the agenda, resolutions, minutes of the meetings, official documents wherein the scheme of offering a commission Rupees 500 in the name and style of CS Mitra, is being offered to ICSI members for every student enrolled in the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI). Also provide the information for the disrepute and/ or degraded the institute by the launch of said commission scheme.
- 6. Please provide the information for the suggestions or feedback taken from members/students/stakeholders before introducing such a commission based incentive scheme for student's admission in the different courses of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI). If yes, please provide the evidences and copies of the same.
- 7. Please provide the name of the President, Council members, or officer or concerned person suggested and voted in favour of the commission based incentive scheme for student's admission in the different courses of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
- 8. Please provide the attempt wise and year wise detailed information and the name of companies participated in the campus placements organized by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at its different regions, chapters and establishments in the last 10 years, including:
 - (a) Name of Rank holders placed in each company
 - (b) Highest salary package offered to :
 - A Rank holder CS
 - A non-rank holder CS
 - (c) Average salary offered to CS during Campus placement
 - (d) Name of Rank holders has not been selected and appointed in campus placement.
- 9. Please provide the certified copy of all the information requested above in point no 1 to 8 above.
- 10. Provide a suitable date and time to inspect the records related to the information requested in all the points above."

(3) The Appellant has submitted in his instant appeal regarding the reply provided by the Respondent to the RTI queries as under:

"Please accept my first appeal against the incomplete information provided by the PIO and provide me an opportunity to appear before the authority."

(4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

"The written submission of the Respondent is as under:-

Written submission to query numbers 1, 2 and 3: - Our reply remains the same. "This information sought is available on the website of the Institute i.e. www.icsi.edu".

Written submission to query numbers 4, 6 and 8: - "Data not maintained".

Written submission to query number 5: - "Query is not specific".

Written submission to query number 7: - "Query is not clear".

Written submission to query numbers 9 and 10: - "This information sought is voluminous and not available in compiled form. As per Section 7(9), such compilation would disproportionately divert the resources".

Further, it is to inform that the "the public authority under the RTI Act, 2005 is not to create or collate information; or to interpret information. Therefore, the information which is readily available in the format/content can only be provided to the appellant and not as per the choice of the information seeker. The reply(ies) to the query(ies) cannot be created and designed in the manner and wish of the appellant.

Therefore, the contents made in the RTI reply stands as it is and the appeal deserves to be dismissed."

- (5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

This office concurs with the submissions of the Respondent in his reply to the instant appeal.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-

(Asit Kumar Rath)
First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

1. Mr. Dinesh Vats
202 Nidhi Plaza-1
LSC Gulabi Bagh
Delhi – 110052
North Delhi
Pin - 110052
2. Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi - 110003
3. Directorate of IT - For publishing on the website