

OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY
(Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005)
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House
C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area
Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)

Appeal No. 000029/2026

IN THE MATTER OF:

Viral
Chandra Nagar

Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi – 110003

Respondent

Date of Order: 22nd June, 2026

ORDER

- (1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal No. ICSOI/A/E/26/00029 on 25/05/2026 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with Response vide letter dated 14/05/2026 against the Central Public Information Officer (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
- (2) The Appellant vide his RTI Application No. ICSOI/R/E/26/01358 dated 20/04/2026 has requested the following information:

“The detailed evaluation criteria, marking scheme, and model answer guidelines followed by examiners for each paper of the Executive Programme, namely:

- 1) Jurisprudence, Interpretation & General Laws
- 2) Company Law & Practice
- 3) Setting Up of Business, Industrial & Labour Laws
- 4) Corporate Accounting & Financial Management
- 5) Capital Market & Securities Laws

6) Economic, Commercial & Intellectual Property Laws

7) Tax Laws and Practice

- The standard parameters or benchmarks used by examiners while assessing answer sheets (such as presentation, legal language, caselaw references, working notes, and accuracy).

Whether there are any official instructions, moderation policies, or examiner training guidelines issued by the Institute for uniform evaluation.

Any guidelines provided to students regarding answer-writing expectations for scoring high marks.”

(3) The Appellant has submitted in his instant appeal regarding the reply provided by the Respondent to the RTI queries as under:

1. What are the ICSI answer evaluation rules, marking scheme, and guidelines used while checking CS exam answers? How are marks given in each subject in CS Executive exams
2. Rules for step marking, partial marking, and negative marking, if applicable.
3. How marks awarded in moderation policy and moderation process used after evaluation
4. Whether examiners are bound to follow ICSIs official Guideline Answers strictly while checking or module provided by ICSI to students
5. Common reasons for deduction of marks in all subjects
6. How should one write in cs executive to get marks for each subject and diffract type of questions

Group 1

Paper 1 Jurisprudence, Interpretation & General Laws

Paper 2 Company Law & Practice

Paper 3 Setting Up of Business, Industrial & Labour Laws

Paper 4 Corporate Accounting & Financial Management

Group 2

Paper 5 Capital Market & Securities Laws

Paper 6 Economic, Commercial & Intellectual Property Laws

Paper 7. Tax Laws and Practice

(4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

"It is submitted that we have provided the requisite information as sought by the Applicant (Appellant hereinafter) in his RTI Application ICSOI/R/E/26/01358 dated 20.04.2026, vide letter dated 14.05.2026 (copy enclosed).

Further, this is to inform that that the information sought by the Appellant in the instant RTI Appeal mainly comprises of the information which was not part of the original RTI Application.

The pointwise reply of the information sought in this Appeal is given hereunder.

Point No.	Information Sought	Reply
1	What are the ICSI answer evaluation rules, marking scheme, and guidelines used while checking CS exam answers? How are marks given in each subject in CS Executive exams	The Information has already been provided against the reply of ICSOI/R/E/26/01358 dated 20.04.2026, vide this office letter dated 14.05.2026 and the same is again appended below. <i>"The guideline answers and marking scheme is available at the website of the Institute at weblink https://www.icsi.edu/academic-portal/new-syllabus-2022/guideline-answers-new-syllabus/group2-guideline-answers/"</i>
2	Rules for step marking, partial marking, and negative marking, if applicable.	The Answer Books are evaluated as per model Answers and Marking Scheme approved by the Board of Studies of the Institute and there is no provision of negative marking in the examinations of the ICSI.
3	how marks awarded in moderation policy and moderation process used after evaluation	The Information has already been provided against the reply of ICSOI/R/E/26/01358 dated 20.04.2026, vide this office letter dated 14.05.2026 that, the information sought is

		available in the public domain and again annexed herewith. (Moderation Policy Attached)
4	Whether examiners are bound to follow ICSI official Guideline Answers strictly while checking or module provided by ICSI to students	Information sought is not a part of original RTI Application against which this Appeal has been filed and interrogative in nature also. Therefore, cannot be treated as information under section 2(f) of the RTI Act,2005. However, it is to inform that the Answer Books are evaluated by the Examiners as per the Model Answers and marking scheme approved by the Board of studies of the Institute.
5	Common reasons for deduction of marks in all subjects	Information sought is not a part of original RTI Application against which this Appeal has been filed. Further it is to inform that the ICSI follows an award based marking scheme and not a deduction based marking scheme. Answer Books are evaluated as per the Model Answers and Marking Scheme approved by the Board of Studies of the Institute.
6	how should one write in cs executive to get marks for each subject and different type of questions	Information sought is not a part of original RTI Application against which this Appeal has been filed. The information sought is in the nature of seeking suggestions, guidance and opinion and does not fall under the definition of information under section 2(f) of the RTI Act, 2005. However, for general guidance, it is suggested to the students to refer the Guideline Answers provided by the Institute.

The contents as above made in the RTI reply stands as it is and are candid.

Therefore, the appeal deserves to be dismissed in-limine.”

- (5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

This office concurs with the submissions of the Respondent in his reply to the instant appeal.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-

(Ashvini Kumar Srivastava)
First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

1. Viral
Chandra Nagar
2. Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi – 110003
3. Directorate of IT – For publishing on the website

**Government of India
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
ICSI House, C-37, Sector-62,
NOIDA,, Uttar Pradesh**

Dated: 14/05/2026

To

Shri viral
chandra nagar

Registration Number : ICSOI/R/E/26/01358

Dear Sir/Madam

I am to refer to your Request for Information under RTI Act 2005, received vide letter dated 20/04/2026 and to say that *the pointwise reply is as under.*

(1) The guideline answers and marking scheme is available at the website of the Institute at weblink <https://www.icsi.edu/academic-portal/new-syllabus-2022/guideline-answers-new-syllabus/group2-guideline-answers/>

(2) Examiner training guidelines and official instructions are exempt from disclosure under section 8(1)(d) of the RTI Act,2005.

(3) Moderation policy is available at the website of the Institute and annexed herewith.

.

In case, you want to go for an appeal in connection with the information provided, you may appeal to the Appellate Authority indicated below within **thirty days** from the date of receipt of this letter.

Ashvini Kumar Srivastava

FAA & Joint Secretary

Address: Directorate of Human Resources ICSI House, 22, Institutional Area, Lodi
Road New Delhi

Phone No.: 011-45341013

Yours faithfully

(Nikhat)

CPIO & Deputy Director

Phone No.: 0120-4522023

Email : cpioexam@icsi.edu

MODERATION POLICY FOR CS EXAMINATION RESULTS

The CS examination results are declared after due deliberations and approval at the meeting of the Examination Committee. While considering the results, the Examination Committee generally reviews and takes into account result details of each subject/module of examination with reference to the following-

1. Current examination's subject-wise marks awarded statistics and pass percentage position vis-à-vis similar statistics of the immediate previous 3-4 sessions of examinations.
2. Difficulties, if any, experienced by candidates in solving any question/s due to seeming ambiguity in language or mis-interpretation of question/s, printing error/s, possibility of alternative answers, or such like matters, which could have caused time constraints to candidates in attempting remaining questions.
3. Comparative disparity in marking standard of any examiner/s vis-à-vis valuation standard of all other examiners in the same subject of examination.
4. To bring about acceptable parity on account of element of subjectivity involved in the evaluation standard, to compensate for the difficulties experienced by candidates, to bring uniformity in the evaluation process and to maintain uniform acceptable standard of parity in marking and pass percentage of the candidates vis-à-vis the immediate preceding examinations, the examination committee fixes suitable mark(s) as general moderation or special moderation, as the case be.
5. The moderation policy and criterion, as decided by the examination committee, is thus applied uniformly across the board in finalization and declaration of examination results.