

OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY
(Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005)
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House
C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area
Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)

Appeal No.00028/2025

IN THE MATTER OF:

Mr. Ashutosh Sinha
C-228, Gali No. 8, Tanki road,
Mithapur, Badarpur,
New Delhi,
Pin:110044

Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer (EXAM)
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
C-37, Sector 62, NOIDA- 201309

Respondent

Date of Order: 29th May 2025

ORDER

- (1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal No. ICSOI/A/E/25/00028 on 04.05.2025 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with the Response vide letter dated 08.04.2025 against the Central Public Information Officer (EXAM) (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
- (2) The Appellant vide RTI Application No. ICSOI/R/E/25/01937 dated 07.04.2025 has requested the following information:

“Dear Sir/Mam,

I appeared for the CS Executive Programme (Syllabus 2017) examinations conducted by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India in December 2024. I request certified copies of my evaluated answer sheets under the RTI Act, 2005. My details are as follows:

Name: Ashutosh Sinha
Registration Number: 240880245/01/2021
Roll Number: 306330
Programme: CS Executive (Syllabus 2017)
Exam Session: December 2024

Kindly provide the certified copies of all my evaluated answer sheets for this session.”

- (3) The Appellant has submitted in the instant appeal as follows:

"I had filed an RTI application requesting a copy of my evaluated answer sheet for the CS Executive (Syllabus 2017) December 2024 examination. However, the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) did not provide the actual evaluated answer sheet. Instead, they only shared a summary showing how marks were allotted. This does not fulfill my original request as per the RTI Act provisions, which entitle me to obtain a copy of my evaluated answer sheets. Furthermore, my RTI request was disposed of without addressing this specific concern. Therefore, I am filing this first appeal to request a proper response. My ICSI registration number is 240880245/01/2021, and my roll number for the said exam is 306330."

(4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

"It is submitted that the requisite information as sought by the Applicant (Appellant hereinafter) in his RTI Application ICSOI/R/E/25/01937 dated 07.04.2025 was provided to the Appellant vide letter dated 08/04/2025, in which the Appellant was informed about weblink and the procedure to access the Answer Books through **"ICSI Examination Answer Books Portal"** (Copy of letter enclosed).

Further, it is observed that the Appellant applied separately on the said portal on 01.03.2025. In response to the said application, login credential and other required information to obtain the Answer Books were provided to the Appellant on 01.03.2025 (Copy of email attached). Subsequently, Answer Books were made available to the Appellant on the portal from 11.03.2025 to 10.04.2025 and which were seen by the Appellant on 25.03.2025 (Copy of screenshot attached).

However, Appellant's contention that the complete Answer books were not provided does not hold good as Answer Books provided were complete in all respect.

Furthermore, it was clearly mentioned in our initial response that in case of any difficulty in accessing the Answer Books the student can reach out to us through the designated e-mail id. However, no such request was received from the Appellant. The Appellant was also informed vide email dated 01.03.2025 that no application for supply of copy of evaluated answer Books shall be accepted beyond the Record Retention period of the Institute. The Record Retention Schedule is available in public domain at www.icsi.edu.

Now, it is to state that the Answer Books of December 2024 have been disposed off as per the Record Retention Schedule of the Institute and, hence, we are no longer able to provide the same.

The contents as above made in the RTI reply stands as it is and are candid.

Therefore, the appeal deserves to be dismissed *in-limine*."

(5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

This office concurs with the submissions of the Respondent.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-
(Asit Kumar Rath)
First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

1. Mr. Ashutosh Sinha
C-228, Gali No. 8, Tanki road,
Mithapur, Badarpur,
New Delhi,
Pin:110044
2. Central Public Information Officer (EXAM)
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
C-37, Sector 62, NOIDA- 201309
3. Directorate of IT - For publishing on the website