

OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY
(Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005)
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House
C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area
Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)

Appeal No.00027/2025

IN THE MATTER OF:

Mr. Dinesh Vats
202 Nidhi Plaza-1
LSC Gulabi Bagh
Delhi – 110052
North Delhi

Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi – 110003

Respondent

Date of Order: 22nd May 2025

ORDER

- (1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal- No. ICSOI/A/E/25/00027 on 26.04.2025 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with Response vide letter dated 25.04.2025 against the Central Public Information Officer (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
- (2) The Appellant vide his RTI Application No. ICSOI/R/E/25/01903 dated 30/03/2025 has requested the following information:

“Kindly provide the following information along with duly authenticated and certified documents in support of each and every information requested to be provided to the information seeker:

1. The information for the agenda including the date, month and year of the meeting in which the existing syllabus of the Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) has been approved.
2. The information including the minutes of the meetings in which the existing syllabus of the Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) has been approved.
3. The information for name of the Council member(s), text committee member(s), syllabus committee member(s) and/or any other committee(s) member(s) formed by the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) to change the old syllabus

- into the existing syllabus at the Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
4. The information for the reasons and recommendations to change the old syllabus into the existing syllabus of Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
 5. The information for the name(s), profession(s) and other details of the person(s) constitute the committee(s) and appoint its member(s) to change the syllabus of Income Tax in the course curriculum of the Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
 6. The information for the name(s), profession(s) and other details of the member(s) of the committee(s) constituted for the subject matter of Income tax in the existing syllabus of Executive level (intermediate level) and professional level (final level) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
 7. The information for the name(s) and other detail(s) of the officer(s) and /or person(s) approved and implemented the existing syllabus of Income Tax of the Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
 8. The information for the date, month and year of the implementation of the exiting syllabus of the Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
 9. The information for the name of the President, Vice-President and Secretary of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) at the time of given approval to the implementation of the exiting syllabus of the Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
 10. The information for the name(s) of the Office bearer including elected representative(s) of the members of ICSI, Secretary and other subject expert(s) given instructions and final approval to change the old syllabus of Income Tax at the Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
 11. The information for the assessment, significance and par value of the changed syllabus including the reports and recommendations of the subject and industry experts for the changed syllabus of Income Tax at the Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI) in competence and reference to the recognition and authority given to Company Secretaries (CS) under the proposed Direct Tax Code (DTC) Bill and other necessary amendments.
 12. The information for the need and benefit to change the old syllabus into the existing syllabus of Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI).
 13. The information for the name(s), designation and nature of liability of the responsible person(s) including President, Vice-President, Secretary, Other Council member(s), officer(s) with deliberate intentions to amend the Income Tax syllabus at the Executive level (intermediate level) and Professional level (final level) examination of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India (ICSI), into a poor syllabus.
 14. Provide a suitable date and time to inspect the records related to the information requested in all the points above."

(3) The Appellant has submitted in his instant appeal regarding the reply provided by the

Respondent to the RTI queries as under:

“Provided Incomplete, Misleading or False Information. Request to accept the First Appeal.”

(4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

“The written submission of the Respondent is as under:-

Written submission to query numbers 1, 10 and 13: - Our reply remains the same. “Query is not clear”.

Written submission to query number 2: - “The information sought is exempted under section 8(1)(d) and 8(1)(e) of the Right to Information Act, 2005.”

Written submission to query numbers 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 11, 12 and 14: - Information sought by the RTI Applicant available at the Website of the Institute and the link is provided to the Appellant vide RTI Reply dated 25.04.2025.

Written submission to query number 9: - The information sought is provided to the Appellant vide RTI Reply dated 25.04.2025.

Further, it is to inform that the “the public authority under the RTI Act, 2005 is not to create or collate information; or to interpret information. Therefore, the information which is readily available in the format/content can only be provided to the appellant and not as per the choice of the information seeker. The reply(ies) to the query(ies) cannot be created and designed in the manner and wish of the appellant.

Therefore, the contents made in the RTI reply stands as it is and the appeal deserves to be dismissed.

Prayed accordingly.”

(5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

This office concurs with the submissions of the Respondent in his reply to the instant appeal.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-

(Asit Kumar Rath)
First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

1. Mr. Dinesh Vats

202 Nidhi Plaza-1
LSC Gulabi Bagh
Delhi – 110052
North Delhi

2. Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi - 110003
3. Directorate of IT - For publishing on the website