

OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY
(Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005)
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House
C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area
Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)

Appeal No.00025/2025

IN THE MATTER OF:

Mr. Sumit Maurya
Gali No.-15, F-327 Hari Nagar
Part-2 Jaitpur Badar
New Delhi
Delhi - 110044

Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi – 110003

Respondent

Date of Order: 22nd May 2025

ORDER

- (1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal- No. ICSOI/A/E/25/00025 on 23.04.2025 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with Response vide letter dated 17.04.2025 against the Central Public Information Officer (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
- (2) The Appellant vide RTI Application No. ICSOI/R/E/25/01819 dated 21/03/2025 has requested the following information:

“I, Sumit Maurya, a student of ICSI, registration no. 240661488/05/2018 filing this RTI application under the Right to Information Act, 2005, to seek information regarding my complaint dated 28th August 2024 against my Trainer, Mr. Sanjeev Gupta, Managing Director at NEXGEN and M/s. NEXGEN Financial Solutions Pvt. Ltd. (Trainer) concerning my CS training.

Please provide following information:

1. Copies of all correspondence, memos, e-mails, documents, papers or reports related to my complaint dated 28th August 2024 against my Trainer, Mr. Sanjeev Gupta, Managing Director at NEXGEN and M/s. NEXGEN Financial Solutions Pvt. Ltd.
2. Copies of all internal correspondence, emails, memos, draft notes, notes or papers related to my complaints dated 28th August 2024 against my Trainer, Mr. Sanjeev Gupta, Managing Director at NEXGEN and M/s. NEXGEN Financial Solutions Pvt. Ltd.
3. Copies of any investigation reports, memos, emails, documents or communications

regarding the investigation into my complaint, including actions taken (including date of action) since 28th August 2024, by ICSI including DIRECTORATE OF TRAINING.

4. Any findings, documents, memos, papers or reports generated from the investigation into my complaint.
5. Copies of minutes or agendas and notes to agenda of any meetings of the Competent Authority concerning my complaint, held during the period since 28th August 2024.
6. Copies of minutes or agendas and notes to agenda of any meetings of the Student Disciplinary Committee concerning my complaint, held during the period since 28th August 2024.
7. Names and designations of the current members of the Competent Authority handling my complaint.
8. Names and designations of the members and chairman of the Student Disciplinary Committee during the period 1st September 2024 to 18th January 2025, and current members and chairman of the Student Disciplinary Committee.”

- (3) The Appellant has submitted in his instant appeal regarding the reply provided by the Respondent to the RTI queries as under:

“I am filing this First Appeal under Section 19 of the Right to Information Act, 2005, against the response provided by the Director/Central Public Information Officer (CPIO), **Mr. Bano Dandona**, regarding **my RTI application dated 21/03/2025**. **I am dissatisfied with the CPIO’s response as it fails to provide the requested information and uses vague reasons to deny my queries.** Below, I outline my concerns and request a review of the CPIO’s response.

Background of the Case:

As per the email from the **ICSI Directorate of Training dated 05.01.2025** (copy attached), I was informed that:

1. That they have updated my case to **Competent Authority**, and
2. That my case was taken up to Student Disciplinary Committee for further investigation and passing of final order.

Since, 05.01.2025, Despite my repeated follow-ups with the ICSI Training Department to seek updates on the progress of my complaint, the investigation timeline, and actions taken against my trainer, I have received no response. **Consequently, I filed an RTI application to obtain details about my case. However, the CPIO’s response was unsatisfactory and incomplete.**

GROUND FOR APPEAL:

Query No. 1: Denial of Copies of Correspondence Related to My Complaint

I requested copies of all correspondence, memos, emails, documents, papers, or reports **RELATED TO MY COMPLAINT DATED 28.08.2024**. The CPIO denied this by labelling the query as “**unspecific.**” **I fail to understand how a request for documents specifically related to my complaint, with a clear date, is unspecific.** This information is critical to understanding the status or progress on of my case since I filed my initial Complaint dated 28/08/2024, and denying it **without valid justification** violates my Right to Information. I request the Appellate Authority to direct the CPIO to provide all relevant documents.

Query Nos. 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6: Claim of Information Not Available

In response to these queries, the CPIO stated that the information sought is **“not available” without providing any justification or reason.** These queries sought details about actions taken by the Directorate of Training, the Student Disciplinary Committee, or any other Competent Officers who was handling my case, in response to my complaint.

If the information is indeed unavailable, does this imply that no action has been taken by ICSI or its officials to address my complaint? I request the Appellate Authority to seek clarification from the CPIO and provide the requested information or a valid reason for its unavailability.

Query No. 7: Information on Competent Authority

I asked for details about the Competent Authority handling my complaint. The CPIO dismissed this as an “ambiguous query.” **My request was clear and specific, seeking the identity and role of the authority responsible for my case.** Denying this information without proper reasoning is unjustified. I urge the Appellate Authority to ensure this information is provided.

Query No. 8: Information on Student Disciplinary Committee

I requested details about the Chairman and members of the Student Disciplinary Committee from 01.09.2024 to 18.01.2025, as well as the current members and Chairman. The CPIO stated that this information is **“not available.” If this is true, does it mean that ICSI has not constituted a Student Disciplinary Committee during this period?** This raises serious concerns about the handling of my complaint. I request the Appellate Authority to verify this claim and provide the requested details or explain why such a committee does not exist.

RELIEF SOUGHT:

1. Direct the CPIO to provide complete, structured and accurate information for all queries raised in my RTI application.
2. If any information is genuinely unavailable, provide a detailed justification explaining why and whether it indicates inaction by ICSI or its officials.
3. Ensure that all documents, correspondence, and details related to my complaint dated 28.08.2024 are shared transparently and accurately.
4. Take appropriate action against the CPIO if the denial of information is found to be unjustified or in violation of the RTI Act, 2005.

Attachments:

1. Copy of ICSI email dated 05.01.2025.
2. Copy of my RTI application **dated 21/03/2025.**
3. Copy of CPIO's response.

I trust that the Appellate Authority will review my appeal objectively and ensure compliance with the provisions of the RTI Act, 2005. I look forward to a favourable response within the stipulated time.”

(4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

“Written submission to query numbers 1 to 6: -

Mr. Sumit Maurya, the Appellant is a student of ICSI, registration no. 240661488/05/2018.

The Appellant had filed a complaint dated 28th August 2024 against his trainer i.e. Mr. Sanjeev Gupta, Managing Director at NEXGEN and M/s. NEXGEN Financial Solutions Pvt. Ltd.

It is submitted that the aforesaid complaint is under investigation. The information sought is related to the said complaint which is under investigation and the disclosure of the same would impede the process of Investigation. Therefore, the information sought is exempted under Section 8(1)(h) of the RTI Act, 2005. Even otherwise the Appellant has not sought any specific information.

Written submission to query number 7 and 8: -

The details of the Student Disciplinary Committee Members are as under:

2024

Chairman of the Committee	CS Dhananjay Shukla - The Vice President of ICSI
Member 1	CS Manish Gupta, Former President & Council Member, The ICSI
Member 2	CS Suresh Pandey, Council Member, The ICSI

2025

Chairman of the Committee	CS Pawan G. Chandak, The Vice President of ICSI
Member 1	CS Manish Gupta, Former President & Council Member, The ICSI
Member 2	CS Manoj Kumar Purbey, Council Member, The ICSI

Therefore, the contents made in the RTI reply stands as it is and the appeal deserves to be dismissed.

Prayed accordingly.”

- (5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

This office concurs with the submissions of the Respondent in his reply to the instant appeal.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-

(Asit Kumar Rath)
First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

1. Mr. Sumit Maurya

Gali No.-15, F-327 Hari Nagar
Part-2 Jaitpur Badar
New Delhi
Delhi - 110044

2. Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi - 110003
3. Directorate of IT - For publishing on the website