

**OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY**  
**(Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005)**  
**The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House**  
**C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area**  
**Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)**

**Appeal No.00040/2024**

IN THE MATTER OF:

Shri Abhyuday D  
No 7B 1103 Provident Sunworth  
Venkatapura village ,Kengeri  
Bangalore, Karnataka . 560060

Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer (EXAM)  
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India  
C-37, Sector 62, NOIDA- 201309

Respondent

Date of Order: 18<sup>th</sup> April, 2024

**ORDER**

(1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal- No. ICSOI/A/E/24/00040 on 24.03.2024 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with Response Ref No. ICSOI/R/E/24/07420 dated 18.03.2024 against the Central Public Information Officer (CPIO) (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.

(2) The Appellant vide his application dated 19.02.2024 has requested to provide information regarding the Evaluator, the Evaluation Process and Qualification of the Evaluator and the Experience of the Evaluator for Paper Code 421 (Jurisprudence Interpretation and General Laws).

(3) The Appellant has informed in the instant appeal that “Refused access to information requested”.

(4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

“It is submitted that the Applicant (Appellant hereinafter) in his RTI Application ICSOI/R/E/24/07420 dated 19.03.2024, sought information regarding “the evaluator, the Evaluation process, Qualification and Experience of the evaluator for Paper Code 421”

In response to the above RTI Application the reply was given to the Appellant vide letter dated 21.03.2024 wherein the information sought was treated as exempt from disclosure under section (1)(d) and section 8(1)(j) of the RTI ACT, 2005(Copy of Letter attached).

Further, in the instant Appeal, the Appellant has expressed his opinion on the validity of applicability of Section 8(1)(d) and Section 8 (1)(j) and sought the information once again.

This is to submit that the nature of Examination being highly confidential and secret prohibits Institute to disclose the identity of Examiners as it is very much required to ensure free and fair

evaluation. Thus, the details of evaluators, including their qualification and experience, is directly related to personal information of Examiners and exempt from disclosure”.

(5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

The Office concurs with submission of the Respondent.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-

(Sonia Baijal)

First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

- 1.. Shri Abhyuday D  
No 7B 1103 Provident Sunworth  
Venkatapura village ,Kengeri  
Bangalore, Karnataka . 560060
2. Central Public Information Officer (EXAM)  
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India  
C-37, Sector 62, NOIDA- 201309
3. Directorate of IT - For publishing on the website