

**OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY**  
**(Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005)**  
**The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House**  
**C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area**  
**Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)**

**Appeal No.00035/2024**

IN THE MATTER OF:

Mr. Vishal Vats  
Flat No. 149, Pocket – 2, Sector 22,  
Rohini, Delhi – 110 085

Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer  
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India  
ICSI House 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road  
New Delhi - 110 003

Respondent

Date of Order: 15<sup>th</sup> April 2024

**ORDER**

- (1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal- No. ICSOI/A/E/24/00035 on 18.03.2024 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with Response Ref No. ICSOI/R/E/24/00221 dated 11.03.2024 against the Central Public Information Officer (CPIO) (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
- (2) The Appellant vide his application dated 13.02.2024 has requested to provide the following information:
  - A. Sir, I would like to know my marks for both Interview and Written exam, as I am worried with Opaque procedure followed by your good self for not displaying the result publicly that too for a public post which itself is violation to the guidelines of the Hon'ble Supreme Court.
  - B. Furthermore, the advertisement dated 7-06-2023, mentions nowhere that seat will be reserved for category and to the utter shock same was disclosed at the time of interview only. Kindly please let me know the relevant details and also the marks for the shortlisted candidates and also reserved name candidate list, In order to pursue my further course of action
- (3) The Appellant has informed in the instant appeal that "Provided incomplete, misleading or false information".
- (4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

"Since the RTI application pertains to the Directorate of Human Resources of the ICSI, therefore, the

CPIO has asked for written submission from the concerned Directorate for the same. Their submission is mentioned below:-

It is to inform that after submission of RTI reply, the joining process for the post of Executive (Law) has now been completed. Therefore, the CPIO has no objection if First Appellate Authority deem it fit providing marks of shortlisted/ selected candidates.

Further, the query pertaining to the relevant details of candidates is ambiguous in nature.

It is also necessary to mention that as per records as on 09.04.2024, there is no reserved candidate for the said post”.

- (5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

CPIO is advised to provide information as requested by the Appellant within 30 days from the date of issue of this order.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-

(Sonia Baijal)  
First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

1. Mr. Vishal Vats  
Flat No. 149, Pocket – 2, Sector 22,  
Rohini, Delhi – 110 085
2. Mr. Saidutta Mishra  
Central Public Information Officer  
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India  
ICSI House, 22, Institutional Area Lodi Road  
New Delhi - 110 003
3. Directorate of IT - For publishing on the website